



1200 G Street, NW  
Suite 500  
Washington, DC 20005

P: +1 202-628-6380  
W: [www.atis.org](http://www.atis.org)

December 12, 2022

Martin Dolly  
PTSC Chair

**Re: ATIS Letter Ballot PTSC-LB-277 Closing Letter**

Dear Martin:

ATIS Letter Ballot PTSC-LB-277, entitled "PTSC-LB-277, *draft proposed ATIS Standard, Signature-based Handling of Asserted information using toKENs (SHAKEN): Governance Model and Certificate Management (ATIS-1000080.v005)*" closed on December 7, 2022. The results are as follows:

<b>14</b>	<b>Approvals</b> Comments: Cisco, Sinch, Neustar, Comcast
<b>0</b>	<b>Disapprovals</b> No comments
<b>11</b>	<b>Abstentions</b> No comments
<b>4</b>	<b>Ballots not returned</b>
<b>29</b>	<hr/> <b>Voting members</b>

The comments received will be addressed by the committee at an upcoming meeting. Should the resolution(s) be substantive in nature, a default letter ballot will be issued. If there are no substantive edits to the document, it will move to publication.

Sincerely,

***[Original signed by A. Karditzas]***

Anna Karditzas  
Coordinator, Global Standards Development

Cc:

V. Shaikh, PTSC Vice Chair  
J. Wohlgemuth

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

All commenters should use this form when submitting comments on an ATIS Letter Ballot ([view the instructions](#)). This form should accompany the [letter ballot \(via ATIS Workspace\)](#) and will subsequently be used during comment consideration by the appropriate committee/subcommittee.

The commenter should use the “track changes” feature when recommending changes to existing text. Proposed changes to a table, figure, or any other item that is not purely text, should include a summary in the table below and provide the modified table, figure, etc., in the “Other Information” section. The source file for any new figures (Visio, PowerPoint, etc.) must also be included (by either zipping together with this document, or embedding as a file/object).

## Letter Ballot: **PTSC-LB-277**

Company Name: Cisco						
TO BE COMPLETED BY COMMENTER			TO BE COMPLETED BY SUB/COMMITTEE			
Auto#	Page/Section/Line #	Comment	Rationale/Suggested Solution	Type <sup>1</sup>	Res. <sup>2</sup>	Discussion/Explanation/Note (if comment is modified, accepted/modified via a separate ballot comment, or not accepted)
1	Section 6.3.4.2	One reviewer was concerned that the token request API appears to use characters reserved as URI delimiters without the appropriate percent encoding. While this might be covered more generally, it may be clearer to implementers if they are presented with the percent encoding in the examples. One example is in Section 6.3.4.2: “POST /sti-pa/account/:id/tok-en”				

### Other Information (e.g., Tables, Figures):

<sup>1</sup> Type of change: Insert **S** or **NS**: Substantive (**S**) (see [ATIS OP Section A.6](#)) or Non-Substantive (**NS**)

<sup>2</sup> Resolution (how was comment considered): Insert **A**, **AM**, **N**, **I**, or **W**: Accepted (**A**), Accepted as Modified (**AM**), Not Accepted (**N**), For Information/No Action/Noted (**I**), or Withdrawn (**W**).

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

All commenters should use this form when submitting comments on an ATIS Letter Ballot ([view the instructions](#)). This form should accompany the [letter ballot \(via ATIS Workspace\)](#) and will subsequently be used during comment consideration by the appropriate committee/subcommittee.

The commenter should use the “track changes” feature when recommending changes to existing text. Proposed changes to a table, figure, or any other item that is not purely text, should include a summary in the table below and provide the modified table, figure, etc., in the “Other Information” section. The source file for any new figures (Visio, PowerPoint, etc.) must also be included (by either zipping together with this document, or embedding as a file/object).

**Letter Ballot:** **[PTSC-LB-277]**

Company Name: <b>[Sinch]</b>						
TO BE COMPLETED BY COMMENTER				TO BE COMPLETED BY SUB/COMMITTEE		
Auto#	Page/Section/Line #	Comment	Rationale/Suggested Solution	Type <sup>1</sup>	Res. <sup>2</sup>	Discussion/Explanation/Note (if comment is modified, accepted/modified via a separate ballot comment, or not accepted)
1	8/5.2.3/2 41-245	The STI Participant <del>that will be acting as an “originating service provider (OSP) as defined in ATIS-1000074 [Ref 1]</del> obtains STI Certificates from the STI-CA to create signatures authenticating itself as the signing entity and protecting the integrity of the SIP Identity header field. The STI Participant can obtain STI Certificates from any approved STI-CA in the list of approved CAs, which is received from the STI-PA. During the verification process, <del>by the STI-VS, the STI Participant</del> checks that the STI-CA that issued the STI Certificate is in the list of approved STI-CAs received from the STI-PA.	When referring to the certificate management process it is appropriate to use the term “STI Participant,” but in the process of authenticating and verifying it is more appropriate to refer to the role in SHAKEN authentication/verification. Not all STI Participants will be OSPs signing PASSporTs. Likewise, there is no requirement a verifier needs to be an STI Participant that acquires STI certificates.			

<sup>1</sup> Type of change: Insert **S** or **NS**: Substantive (**S**) (see [ATIS OP Section A.6](#)) or Non-Substantive (**NS**)

<sup>2</sup> Resolution (how was comment considered): Insert **A**, **AM**, **N**, **I**, or **W**: Accepted (**A**), Accepted as Modified (**AM**), Not Accepted (**N**), For Information/No Action/Noted (**I**), or Withdrawn (**W**).

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

2	8/5.2.3/2 46-249	<p>The identity-related information in the SIP requests is authenticated by the originating STI Participant's <u>STI-AS function</u> and can be verified by <del>the terminating STI Participant</del> <u>an STI-VS function operated by a "terminating service provider" (TSP) as defined in ATIS-1000074 [Ref 1] or other verifying entity</u>. Information contained within the Personal Assertion Token (PASSporT) [Ref 23] in a SIP message attests to an STI Participant's knowledge of a specific telephone identity that the <del>terminating STI Participant</del> <u>verifying entity</u> can use to determine specific handling for a call.</p>	Clarify the entities/functions that are executing authentication and verification.			
3						

**Other Information (e.g., Tables, Figures):**

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

All commenters should use this form when submitting comments on an ATIS Letter Ballot ([view the instructions](#)). This form should accompany the [letter ballot \(via ATIS Workspace\)](#) and will subsequently be used during comment consideration by the appropriate committee/subcommittee.

The commenter should use the “track changes” feature when recommending changes to existing text. Proposed changes to a table, figure, or any other item that is not purely text, should include a summary in the table below and provide the modified table, figure, etc., in the “Other Information” section. The source file for any new figures (Visio, PowerPoint, etc.) must also be included (by either zipping together with this document, or embedding as a file/object).

## Letter Ballot: *PTSC-LB-277 (PTSC-2022-00069R000)*

Company Name: Neustar						
TO BE COMPLETED BY COMMENTER				TO BE COMPLETED BY SUB/COMMITTEE		
Auto#	Page/ Section/Line #	Comment	Rationale/Suggested Solution	Type <sup>1</sup>	Res. <sup>2</sup>	Discussion/Explanation/Note (if comment is modified, accepted/modified via a separate ballot comment, or not accepted)
1	Page 19/Line 615	Add reference to section 6.3.4.	The CRL mechanism isn't described prior to this section. So, either a forward or backwards reference would be helpful for a new reader.			
2	Page 20/ Line 651, Line 652	The link to the IANA registry is broken.	The text is correct, but the link stops at:  <a href="http://www.iana.org/assignments/smi-numbers/smi-">http://www.iana.org/assignments/smi-numbers/smi-</a>			
3	Page 24/Line 890	Missing double quote after “type:	Change “type: to “type”:			
4	Page 32/Line 1082	Typo: “exclude” should be “excludes”	Change “exclude” to “excludes”			

<sup>1</sup> Type of change: Insert **S** or **NS**: Substantive (**S**) (see [ATIS OP Section A.6](#)) or Non-Substantive (**NS**)

<sup>2</sup> Resolution (how was comment considered): Insert **A**, **AM**, **N**, **I**, or **W**: Accepted (**A**), Accepted as Modified (**AM**), Not Accepted (**N**), For Information/No Action/Noted (**I**), or Withdrawn (**W**).

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

Other Information (e.g., Tables, Figures):

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

All commenters should use this form when submitting comments on an ATIS Letter Ballot ([view the instructions](#)). This form should accompany the [letter ballot \(via ATIS Workspace\)](#) and will subsequently be used during comment consideration by the appropriate committee/subcommittee.

The commenter should use the “track changes” feature when recommending changes to existing text. Proposed changes to a table, figure, or any other item that is not purely text, should include a summary in the table below and provide the modified table, figure, etc., in the “Other Information” section. The source file for any new figures (Visio, PowerPoint, etc.) must also be included (by either zipping together with this document, or embedding as a file/object).

## Letter Ballot: PTSC-LB-277 (PTSC-2022-00069R000)

Company Name: Comcast						
TO BE COMPLETED BY COMMENTER				TO BE COMPLETED BY SUB/COMMITTEE		
Auto#	Page/ Section/Line #	Comment	Rationale/Suggested Solution	Type <sup>1</sup>	Res. <sup>2</sup>	Discussion/Explanation/Note (if comment is modified, accepted/modified via a separate ballot comment, or not accepted)
1	Table of Contents	Some section titles are incorrect	Update TOC			
2	Clause 3.1, line 98	Should state that an end-entity is an STI Participant (not Service Provider) to include RespOrgs.	Replace “Service Provider” with “STI Participant.			
3	Clause 3.1, line 122	The term “Service Provider” is used in document but not defined here	Add entry to define “Service Provider”			
4	Clause 3.2, line 145	The abbreviation “SP” is used in the document (e.g., clause 5.2) but not defined here.	Add entry for “SP” (an “STI Participant”)			
5	Clause 6.3.10, line 1055	[Ref xx] is missing for ATIS-1000092 and RFC 9060.here for RFC 9060. There are other cases of this in a few other sections.	Add missing references.			

<sup>1</sup> Type of change: Insert **S** or **NS**: Substantive (**S**) (see [ATIS OP Section A.6](#)) or Non-Substantive (**NS**)

<sup>2</sup> Resolution (how was comment considered): Insert **A**, **AM**, **N**, **I**, or **W**: Accepted (**A**), Accepted as Modified (**AM**), Not Accepted (**N**), For Information/No Action/Noted (**I**), or Withdrawn (**W**).

# ATIS Letter Ballot Comment Submittal Form and Consideration Report

6	Clause 6.4.1, line 1076	“Certificate profile” should be Certificate Profile” (upper case)	s/Certificate profile/Certificate Profile/			
---	----------------------------	--	--	--	--	--

Other Information (e.g., Tables, Figures):