|  |
| --- |
| All commenters should use this form when submitting comments on an ATIS Letter Ballot ([view the instructions](http://www.atis.org/01_resources/docs/LB/ATIS_LB_CCRPreso.pdf)). ­This form should accompany the [letter ballot (via ATIS Workspace)](http://www.atis.org/01_aws/faqs.asp#Ballot) and will subsequently be used during comment consideration by the appropriate committee/subcommittee.  The commenter should use the “track changes” feature when recommending changes to existing text. Proposed changes to a table, figure, or any other item that is not purely text, should include a summary in the table below and provide the modified table, figure, etc., in the “Other Information” section. The source file for any new figures (Visio, PowerPoint, etc.) must also be included (by either zipping together with this document, or embedding as a file/object). |

## Letter Ballot: [PTSC & PTSC-LB-243]

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Company Name: [Neustar]** | | | | | | |
| **TO BE COMPLETED BY COMMENTER** | | | | **TO BE COMPLETED BY SUB/COMMITTEE** | | |
| **Auto#** | **Page/ Section/Line #** | **Comment** | **Rationale/Suggested Solution** | **Type[[1]](#footnote-1)** | **Res.**[[2]](#footnote-2) | **Discussion/Explanation/Note *(if comment is modified, accepted/modified via a separate ballot comment, or not accepted)*** |
|  | Pg 1/2 | Could not find an active “draft-ietf-acme-authority-token” document? | Confirm active document and not expired (e.g., a version 04)? | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 1/2 | Fix footnote 4 references and add associated text as needed |  | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 3/3.1 | Delete “ACME” from SPC Token definition | ACME is not required, at least not in this definition. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/ 5.2.1 | Change “in the STI certificate” to “in the STI certificate or Certification Path” in second paragraph | Reinforces that an STI-VS may dereference a certificate chain. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/5.2.1 | Change “token” to “Token” at end of third paragraph and throughout when used per the definition | Per definition in Clause 3.1. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/5.2.1 | Fix reference error at end of third paragraph |  | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/5.2.2 | Delete “valid” in second sentence | Redundant. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/5.2.3 | Change “identity” to “Identity” in first sentence | Consistency. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/5.2.3 | Delete third sentence including “preferred” | Clause 6.3.2 does not detail how the SP communicates its preferred STI-CA(s) to the STI-PA. “Preferred” in this context seems to apply to the SP independently determining which STI-CA(s) is/are preferred? | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 8/5.2.3 | Change second to last sentence in the second paragraph: “…identities that the terminating SP can use” to “…identities, can be used by the terminating SP” | Clarity. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 10/6.3 | Change “an automated” to “the preferred and automated” in first sentence | ACME not a requirement. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 11/6.3.1 | Change first “ACME” to “recommended ACME” | ACME not a requirement. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 13/6.3.3 | Correct Clause reference in first NOTE |  | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 15/6.3.4.1 | Delete “and TN identity information” in first sentence | Single SPC only. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 15/6.3.4.1 | Delete “\” in last sentence of second paragraph | Typo. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 16/6.3.4.1 | Change “TnAuthList” to “TNAuthList” in JWT Payload example | Typo. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 18/6.3.5 | Change “token” to “Token” here and throughout when used per the definition | Per definition in Clause 3.1. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 18/6.3.5.1 | Change “list” to “List” in next to last paragraph | Typo. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 21/6.3.5.2 | Fix reference error under item “5)” |  | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 24/6.3.5.2 | Change “STI-certificate” to “STI certificate” under item “12)” | Consistency. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 25/6.3.6 | Change “certificate” to “STI certificate” in last sentence | Consistency and clarity. | NS | A |  |
|  | Figure 6.3 | Change “CA token” to “SPC Token” | Inconsistent use of “token”. | NS | A |  |
|  | Figure 6.4 | Change “Poll to” to “Poll” | Typo. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 27/6.3.8 | Delete “as credentials” in last sentence | Clarity. | NS | A |  |
|  | Pg 28/6.3.8 | Change “, when a certificate” to “when a certificate” in sentence two paragraphs preceding Figure 6.5. | Comma not needed. | NS | A |  |
|  | Figure 6.5 | Change “CA token” to “SPC Token” | Inconsistent use of “token”. | NS | A |  |
|  | Appendix | Change “TNAuthorizationList” to “TN Authorization List” throughout Appendix text | Consistency. | NS | A |  |

**Other Information (e.g., Tables, Figures):**

1. Type of change: Insert **S** or **NS**: Substantive (**S**) (*see* [*ATIS OP*](http://www.atis.org/01_legal/operatingpro.asp) *Section A.6*) or Non-Substantive (**NS**) [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Resolution (how was comment considered): Insert **A**, **AM**, **N**, **I**, or **W**: Accepted (**A**), Accepted as Modified (**AM**), Not Accepted (**N**), For Information/No Action/Noted (**I**), or Withdrawn (**W**). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)